



The CENTRAL ISSUE in the

RAPE TRIAL

MOHAMAD ISMAIL MOHAMAD YUNUS



**HUM
Press**

The CENTRAL ISSUE in the

RAPE TRIAL

Mohamad Ismail Mohamad Yunus



**IIUM
Press**

Gombak • 2015

First Edition, 2015
©IIUM Press, IIUM

IIUM Press is a member of the Majlis Penerbitan Ilmiah Malaysia – MAPIM
(Malaysian Scholarly Publishing Council)

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means,
electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise,
without any prior written permission of the publisher.

Perpustakaan Negara Malaysia

Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Mohamad Ismail Hj. Mohamad Yunus

The Central in the Rape Trial / Mohamad Ismail

Mohamad Yunus, Ph.D.

ISBN 978-967-418-372-1

1. Rape--Law and legislation--Malaysia. I. Title.
345.59502532

Published by

IIUM Press

International Islamic University Malaysia

P.O. Box 10, 50728 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

Printed in Malaysia by

Contents

	<i>Table of Cases</i>	ix
	<i>List of Abbreviation of Journals/Articles/Periodicals</i>	xv
	<i>Foreword</i>	xix
	<i>Preface</i>	xxi
	<i>Introduction</i>	xxiii
Chapter 1	The Concepts of “Against Her Will” and “Without Her Consent”	1
	Statutory Provisions from Various Common Law Jurisdictions	4
	The Principle of <i>Mens Rea</i> in the Malaysian Penal Code	4
	Case Study: <i>Mens Rea</i> in <i>R. v. Morgan</i> : Is it Applicable in Malaysia?	6
	The Background to Reforming the <i>Mens Rea</i> for Rape in England	8
	Absence of Consent	12
	The Offence of Rape in India	16
	The Application of Consent and Accountability in Rape in Singapore	21
	The Offence of Rape in Singapore	22
	Meaning of Consent	23
	Difference between Consent and Submission	24
	Meaning of Consent under the Penal Code of Malaysia	26
	Studies on How the Courts Determine Consent	27
	The Essentiality of Resistance in Consent	28
	Various Jurisdiction Approach in Determined Consent	37
	Proposal of the Amendment of Rape Law by the Law Commission of India	57
	Conclusion	76
	Provisional Proposal to the Malaysian Penal Code	78

Contents

Chapter 2	Vitiating of Consent	80
	Introduction	80
	The Factors That Vitiating Consent	81
	The Scope of Fraud Vitiates Consent	81
	Fraud as to the Nature and Quality of the Act	84
	Medical Treatment	84
	Transmission of Venereal Disease or Virus	107
	Miscellaneous Fraud as to the Nature and Quality of the Act	113
	Impersonation or Fraud as to the Identity of Other Person	120
	Conclusion	134
	Provisional Proposal to the Malaysian Penal Code	136
Chapter 3	Incapacity to Consent	139
	Consent Given by Minors and Young Persons	140
	Consent of Persons Who Lack Intellectual Capacity	162
	Consent while in the State of Insensibility or Unconsciousness	180
	Conclusion	200
	Provisional Proposal to the Malaysian Penal Code	201
	Incapacity to Consent	202
	Meaning of Incapacity	202
Chapter 4	Vitiating of Consent by Threats or Fear	203
	Introduction	203
	Threat or Fear of Bodily Harm	204
	Threat of Harm to a Third Party	228
	Threat or Fear Induced by a Third Party	231
	Immediacy of Threat	232
	Reasonableness of the Threats	234
	Threat or Fear of Non-Bodily Harm and Other Pressures	236
	Sexual Exploitation	237
	Economic Pressure	248

Contents

Threat of Unlawful Detention or Malicious Prosecution	252
Sexual Blackmail	253
Statutory Provisions on Threat or Fear and Other Pressures	257
Conclusion	293
Provisional Proposal to the Malaysian Penal Code	296
Inducing Sexual Intercourse by Threats of Bodily Harm	296
Inducing Sexual Intercourse by Threats of Non-Bodily Harm and Other Pressures	296
Chapter 5 The Legal Status of Consent to Sexual Intercourse: An Islamic Dimension	298
Introduction	298
Definition of Rape under Islamic Law and Malaysian Law	302
The Physical Elements of Rape under Islamic Law and Malaysian Law	310
The Act of Sexual Intercourse	310
The Absence of Consent	312
Factors Vitiating Consent According to Islamic Law	314
Incapacity Negates Consent	314
Fraud (<i>khid'a</i>) or Mistake (<i>khat'a</i>)	
Negates Consent	316
Coercion (<i>Ikrāh</i>) Negates Consent	318
Evidence in Rape under Islamic Law and Malaysian Law	321
Conclusion	326
Bibliography	329
Index	343